

EXHIBIT C

1 [13:37:01]

2 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: -- been concurred in on second reading.

3 Members, you now have before you for your consideration Senate Bill
4 419. The clerk will read the title of the bill.

5 CLERK: Mr. Chair. Senate Bill No. 419 introduced by Vance, a
6 bill for an act and title, an act banning TikTok in Montana prohibiting
7 a mobile application store from offering the TikTok application of
8 Montana users providing for penalties, providing for enforcement
9 authority, providing definitions, providing for contingent voidness and
10 providing a delayed effective date, Mr. Chair.

11 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: What is your pleasure, Representative Ler?

12 REP. LER: Mr. Chair, [INDISCERNIBLE 13:37:27] this committee
13 does [INDISCERNIBLE 13:37:28] report after having had under
14 consideration Senate Bill 419. I recommend the same be concurred in.

15 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Representative Ler.

16 REP. LER: Mr. Chair, we are facing a threat unlike any other
17 from the Chinese Communist Party hiding behind TikTok where they can
18 spy on Americans by collecting personal information by keystrokes and
19 even use their locations. That's why I urge you to join me in voting
20 yes on Senate Bill 419 to ban TikTok in Montana. TikTok is a national
21 security threat. This app steals information and data from users and
22 its ability to share that data with the Chinese Communist Party is
23 unacceptable and infringes on Montana's rights to privacy. Last year,
24 TikTok admitted to using their app to spy on American journalists. The
25 FBI has recently raised national security concerns over the use of
TikTok and warns that the Chinese government could influence users or

1 control their devices with the app. We know that the People's Republic
2 of China is one of our top adversaries yet we allow them to freely
3 gather information about Montana, about Montanans, Montana's companies
4 and the intellectual property of its users. China is after our data and
5 intellectual property. We saw another example recently with the Chinese
6 spy balloons that hovered right over our state. This bill will not only
7 protect Montanans' right to privacies and its users and other users
8 alike but also their health, safety and especially our young people.
9 TikTok allows and promotes dangerous challenges like throwing objects
10 in moving automobiles, taking excessive amounts of medication, lighting
11 minors on fire, also including cooking chicken in NyQuil, pouring hot
12 wax on user's faces and placing metal objects in electrical outlets. In
13 Montana, we have seen the results of some of these TikTok challenges,
14 like one that encourages kids to destroy and steal school property and
15 another one that encourage threats of violence enclose Bitterroot
16 Valley schools. One particular disturbing incidence, a 13-year-old girl
17 in the City of Montana was shot in the face with a BB gun and was sent
18 to the hospital as part of one of these TikTok challenges. Our state
19 through the Montana Department of Justice also launched an
20 investigation last year into the company for possible violations of
21 Montana's unfair trade practices.

22 [13:40:00]

23 Members of the body, I believe it's time we stand up to the
24 Chinese and ban TikTok.

25 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you, Representative. Is there a
discussion on the bill? Representative Sullivan?

1 REP. SULLIVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chair. All right. I want to start
2 out by saying that -- I'll speak to the bill, Mr. Chair. Sorry. I'm
3 disappointed that TikTok did not send someone to testify in the bill
4 hearing in House Judiciary. I went to that hearing, I was pretty
5 excited to have questions that I could ask that company about this bill
6 and about the concerns that are being expressed in this room today, and
7 no one was at the microphone from their company. And so, I know
8 Montana, we have a small population. I know we are considered rural,
9 but we matter and our laws matter, and I know that TikTok recognizes
10 that because they have spent a lot of money on billboards and ads, and
11 my constituents called me yesterday. They are getting robo calls about
12 this bill. So, I just wanted to take a quick shout out that next time
13 I'd like to see Big Tech show up in Montana and take questions from us
14 and get in the hot seat. You're not the first big company to not come
15 to our state and I know you won't be the last, but I am calling you out
16 in this moment. I also want to second, say that I care deeply about
17 privacy and security. I understand the concerns that this bill was
18 started from. You all know that I enjoy a good privacy bill. I do not
19 want to see Montanans' data abused. I don't want to see it traded
20 around to adversarial countries. I get why people are concerned and
21 this bill does tempt me very much. However, I think I will be voting no
22 today. I don't believe that this bill as written is taking privacy and
23 security seriously. We only have one company listed and we only have
24 one country listed. Why would we do that, why would we limit to one
25 company and one country when we know very well that social media
companies are doing the same thing. Other ones, they are selling and

1 trading and using Montanans' data and they're sending it to servers
2 located all over the world. So, why aren't they in this bill? Why do we
3 only have one? I also am concerned, this is a constitutional issue. I
4 think it's Article 5, Section 12. There is a constitutional issue
5 where we have listing a company specifically in a bill and I know
6 that's going to lead to issues. Overall, I just don't think it's taking
7 concerns seriously. So, Mr. Chair, I'd like to move an amendment --
8 where am I at? I move that Senate Bill 419 be amended and request that
9 amendment 002.002 be posted and deemed read, Mr. Chair.

10 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: So ordered.

11 REP. SULLIVAN: Thank you, Mr. Chair. All right. So, if you take
12 out your amendment, we have some great whereas clauses, and I think
13 that they will explain the concept of this bill. Whereas foreign
14 adversaries of the United States and Montana have an interest in
15 gathering information about Montanans, Montana companies and the
16 intellectual property of users who engage in corporate and internal
17 espionage. And if you flip it over, you can see the next whereas. A
18 foreign adversary's collection and use of information and data from
19 Montana users, unacceptably infringes on Montanans' right to privacy.
20 So, what we're doing here in Section 1 is social media applications.
21 So, we're defining that. We are saying, "oh, all social media
22 applications are falling under this bill," or many not operate within
23 territorial jurisdiction of Montana if they allow the collection of
24 personal information or data and that data to be transferred to an
25 entity or person within a country designated as a foreign adversary,
and that is under federal rule. So, we have a list of foreign

1 adversarial countries. Currently, that is China, Cuba, Iran, North
2 Korea, Russia and the Venezuelan Maduro Regime. So, let's expand this
3 bill. Let's do it seriously. The AG can still enforce this. We still
4 have lots of penalties if they have a discrete violation. Let's protect
5 Montanans from all abusive social media companies. Let's protect
6 Montanans from all bad acting adversarial countries. Let's do this the
7 right way and I'm happy to answer questions, Mr. Chair.

8 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you, representative. Is there a
9 discussion on the amendment? Representative Ler?

10 REP. LER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I urge the body to resist this
11 amendment. This amendment completely strips the whole intent of the
12 bill and it makes the bill unworkable. There is a reason why we put one
13 company in this bill, because that one company is owned and operated
14 and completely solely owned by the Chinese Communist Party.

15 [13:45:02]

16 These other companies are all in the state, are all in the United
17 States and that is the reason why the bill is written the way it is, so
18 I urge the body to resist this amendment.

19 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you, Representative. Further discussion
20 on the amendment. Representative Mercer?

21 REP. MERCER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I just simply want to make
22 a disclosure that I work for a firm that represents technology
23 companies operating a range of content platforms. Thank you, Mr.
24 Chairman.

25 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you, representative. Is there further
 discussion on the amendment? Representative Essmann.

1 REP. ESSMANN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Question for the
2 amendment sponsor, please.

3 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Does the amendment sponsor yield?

4 REP. SULLIVAN: I do.

5 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Representative Essmann.

6 REP. ESSMANN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Good representative, you
7 made a statement citing a constitutional reference, talking about
8 proper names, and I looked it up and I don't see it in that particular
9 section. Could you please tell me what section you see the proper name
10 referenced in? Thank you.

11 REP. SULLIVAN: Thank you. Mr. Chair, if you give me one moment,
12 good representative. To clarify what I'm talking about in Article 5,
13 Section 12 of the Montana Constitution, it says it's called Local and
14 Special Legislation, and that's the part I'm talking about here, and it
15 says the Legislature shall not pass a special or local act when a
16 general act can be made or is applicable. So, what I'm referencing
17 there is that having a bill that only calls out one company be a name
18 is most likely a violation of Article 5, Section 12 of the Montana
19 Constitution.

20 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Representative Essmann?

21 REP. ESSMANN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Follow up.

22 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Does the amendment sponsor continue to yield?

23 REP. SULLIVAN: Yes, I do.

24 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Representative Essman.

25 REP. ESSMANN: Thank you, good representative. So, then it isn't
the fact that we used a proper name in the bill, it's the fact that it

1 calls out a particular company then instead of being a broad general
2 issue.

3 REP. SULLIVAN: Mr. Chair, Representative, you are correct. That
4 is what I am saying is problematic. With 419 as written and with the
5 amendment, we would no longer be having a special legislation for one;
6 however, we'd be making a general act for all.

7 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you. Further discussion. Representative
8 Harvey.

9 REP. HARVEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair, members of the body, I'm
10 going to stand in strong support of my seatmate's amendment. Having
11 served in economic affairs over the last interim, we took a look at
12 privacy. We took a look at several different things dealing with how
13 vulnerable Montanans can be on these digital platforms. And if we
14 continue to keep our head in the sand and think that it's just one
15 platform that is selling our information overseas, we're going to be in
16 trouble. I think this is a great amendment. I think it aligns it with
17 our Constitution and I think it protects Montanans. Just because this
18 one company is owned overseas doesn't mean that there's not bad actors
19 that are operating in the United States and turning around and selling
20 our information overseas. If we truly want to do what's right and
21 protect Montanans, let's make it abroad. Let's take a stance today and
22 say that we're tired of this. We don't want our information being sold
23 overseas regardless if the company is owned in the United States or
24 not. That's how I think, that's how I want to protect my constituents.
25 If you can go home and say that you feel that just one company is doing
this and think that your constituents are going to believe you, then

1 don't vote for this amendment. But I'm urging you to vote green and
2 let's protect Montanans.

3 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you. Further discussion on the
4 amendment. Representative Jay Hinkle.

5 REP. HINKLE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Speak to the amendment. So a
6 little bit of saddened that this amendment was brought on the floor
7 because it's a very substantial change to the bill. And I would think
8 that this amendment should have been brought in committee so that we at
9 least could have discussed it in committee, perhaps even brought during
10 the hearing and propose that way the public would have the chance to
11 weigh in on this and maybe these other social media platforms would be
12 able to have their representatives here to discuss this. So I think
13 it's really bad to put such a substantial change into this bill without
14 it being vetted and without the public having an opportunity to
15 comment.

16 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you. Further discussion on the
17 amendment. Got two in the queue. Representative Essmann, apologies for
18 not continuing to recognize you after you're done with your questions.
19 Representative Essmann.

20 REP. ESSMANN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I'm sorry to stand up
21 again, but I did want to just speak to the amendment a little bit. I
22 don't want anybody to come away thinking what I said earlier was
23 endorsing this amendment. Quite the contrary. I just want us to know
24 that when we hear that there's been a quote from the Constitution, we
25 all understand what that was about.

[13:50:03]

1 So that was my purpose. I am not for this amendment. I am for the
2 bill as originally written. And I would agree with my seatmate back
3 here that this probably should have been brought in committee. So maybe
4 the actual company we're talking about here maybe could have had a
5 chance to come and sign on, but they didn't. So I say let's do one at a
6 time. If we get this done, we can move further on. Thank you.

7 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you. Representative Essmann. Further
8 discussion on the amendment, Representative Butcher.

9 REP. BUTCHER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I look at this amendment
10 and all of a sudden, we're going to be going and trying to dig out
11 every media platform to decide whether they're good guys or bad guys.
12 It's nationally recognized. The problem is, TikTok and the Chinese
13 government guys. Right now, that is our adversary that we're dealing
14 with. And these folks are not just a political adversary, they're an
15 economic adversary, and that's why they're accumulating all this
16 information. But yet we're going to throw an amendment here that says,
17 oh, we're going to look at all these platforms. Well, how much resource
18 are we going to spend to determine which other platforms have a
19 problem? We know this one has a problem, so let's address it one issue
20 at a time, which is TikTok, and it's nationally recognized. I mean,
21 it's on the news all the time, the discussions on this whole TikTok
22 platform and the problems that are coming out of it. So let's not just
23 bury our head in the sand and say, oh, gee, well, we don't want to pick
24 on one company. They're the ones who started this thing, and they're
25 the ones that are the adversary, so let's kill this amendment and go
 ahead and pass the bill, and then Montana will stand up and say, we've

1 had enough of this infiltrating our kids, infiltrating our system, and
2 stealing all of our information. Vote no on the amendment.

3 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you, Representative. There being no
4 further discussion on the amendment, does the amendment sponsor wish to
5 close?

6 REP. ESSMANN: Yes. Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chair. I appreciate
7 the good debate. Everyone. I want to ensure everyone standing, sitting
8 here listening to me today that I am being quite serious with this
9 amendment. I am being quite serious that I am going to a place where I
10 am saying to all social media companies that they need to follow our
11 rules, that we can make it count today. We can make this count in
12 Montana by coming up with a piece of policy that gets everybody to
13 respect the privacy of all Montanans. And that includes more than just
14 one company, and it includes more than just one country. And I think
15 that my amendment is less likely to get struck down. And I do know that
16 the companies, they know the social media companies, they know where
17 their servers are, and they know if their servers are in a foreign
18 adversaries country and they can handle this bill. And if they don't,
19 they're going to get fined, and it's going to get enforced through the
20 AG's office. So I think this is actually taking a bigger, stronger
21 stand for privacy, and I encourage agreeing. Thank you.

22 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you. Now question arises on the
23 amendment of Representative Sullivan. Those in favor, vote aye. Those
24 oppose vote nay. Are there absentee votes?

25 REP. SULLIVAN: None. Mr. Chair.

1 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Has every member voted? Does any member wish
2 to change his or her vote? Representative Mercer? If not, the Clerk
3 will record the vote.

4 REP. MERCER: Mr. Chair, 48 representatives have voted aye. 51
5 have voted no.

6 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: The amendment fails. Members, we are now back
7 on discussion of the bill. Representative Mitchell.

8 REP. MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Members, as the youngest
9 member here, someone born in the 2000s, this bill has been a little
10 different and harder to assess. And I'm sure most folks in here I've
11 had and used TikTok since back when it was musically way back when, so
12 back when I was in junior high, my younger sister, many of my friends
13 make TikToks, and many of them make good money off of it through
14 monetization. My concern with TikTok the other day is ultimately when
15 it comes down to the concerns of privacy and the ties to the Chinese
16 Communist Party. The reason I'm going to support this bill today is
17 because of the contingent voidness, which says if TikTok is acquired by
18 or sold to a company that is not incorporated in any other country,
19 designated as a foreign adversary at the time TikTok is sold or
20 acquired. So what this says is if TikTok is sold or acquired by someone
21 else other than the Chinese Communist Party, this bill is then voided.
22 I'm also going to support this bill because the delayed effective date
23 of January 1, 2024, if Congress acts between now and the 1 January,
24 this next year, which looks like it may or may not happen. You never
25 know with the folks down there in the swamp how they act on things. But
this bill could then be voided as well and then left up to the feds and

1 not the State of Montana. So this has been something I've been back and
2 forth on now for a long time, but I think due to the privacy concerns
3 and with China, --

4 [13:55:01]

5 -- I think that we should move along with this and ban TikTok in
6 Montana. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

7 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you, Representative. Is there further
8 discussion on the bill? Remember to plug in on the bill if you wish to
9 speak. Representative T. Smith.

10 REP. SMITH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. It does speak to the bill.

11 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Representative T. Smith.

12 REP. SMITH: Thank you. This is a great bill. This bill is about
13 a year or two late. My junior at Flathead High School and some of his
14 peers were caught up in one of these TikTok challenges where they would
15 go out and take the lug nuts off one of your wheels on your vehicle. So
16 this bill is about a year or two late and long overdue, and I support
17 it 100%. Thank you.

18 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you, Representative. Further discussion
19 on the bill too, and the key Representative Zephyr.

20 REP. ZEPHYR: Thank you, Mr. Chair and members of the body. I'll
21 be voting no on this bill. And I want to say that I'm not sure any bill
22 we've seen this session I mean this with the greatest respect to this
23 body has such a stark contrast between the seriousness with which the
24 issue, the ongoing issue, is privacy for Montanans' data privacy, how
25 that data is misused, and the lack of expertise in this body to
adequately address it. Data privacy is a really serious concern and

1 that's not really being addressed in this bill. For example, we heard
2 the amendment that we're just looking at TikTok here. TikTok dances,
3 TikTok trends, all that stuff that's been mentioned, those also exist
4 on other social media platforms. And when you talk about the content
5 that you're seeing, the way algorithms work, the more you scroll a
6 thing, the more you see that thing. That's not on a platform itself,
7 that's on a user. I also want to talk about the enforcement of this. It
8 is not viable to enforce. And part of that is because, one, if you want
9 to use a VPN, you can spoof your location and get around this ban
10 instantly. Two, your location is determined so on your computer by your
11 IP address and whatnot. And that can be used zip codes. But if you're
12 on your phone, which is when most folks use TikTok, it is by your cell
13 tower. And if you are on a border town, there is a chance you get your
14 cell data from outside of the state. And so that could be -- you could
15 have Montanans in the edges of our state getting their location being
16 recognized as out of state even though they're in-state, that would
17 provide an equal application of this law to those Montanans versus
18 Montanans in the center of the state. We heard in the committee that
19 the app stores cannot ban, given that information. And for me, I also
20 just want to say very clearly, if we were talking about data privacy, I
21 think we would see a lot more green on that board. But what we heard in
22 committee, what we heard from proponents of this bill, was a lot of
23 conversation around China, around communists, around Red Scare stuff.
24 And to me, the big distinction here is there's nothing stopping another
25 social media company based in America from collecting the same data,
selling it to a Chinese organization, and then them being held to that

1 company. So, what we're saying here is it's okay if American companies
2 do it. It's not okay for Chinese company is doing this. I agree with my
3 seatmate across the aisle that this will probably be solved at the
4 federal level as happened with other social media apps that China run.
5 And as discussions I've had with other folks, I would say that if we're
6 talking about issues of national security, that is first and foremost a
7 federal issue, and they should be talking about it before we ever bring
8 up something like this. I will be a no. Thank you.

9 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you representative as a further
10 discussion on the bill Representative Duram.

11 REP. DURAM: Thank you Mr. Chair, may I speak to the bill.

12 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Representative Duram.

13 REP. DURAM: I did comment on this bill and the committee and it
14 caused a chuckle by my seatmate and I took it kindly the and just
15 recently was mentioned expertise and I think what's really lacking
16 among Americans particularly American youth today is our foundational
17 knowledge of the stories that made most of us who we are. I made
18 reference in committee to the Pied Piper that TikTok is the tune
19 leading our children away and some thought it comical, many of the
20 youth I talked to though they said who's the Pied Piper? And that's
21 sad, that means their mom and dad didn't read to them many of the
22 stories that my mom and dad read to me. The Pied Piper just so
23 everybody knows, the backstory is that a village had rats, eating their
24 grain.

25 [14:00:00]

1 They wanted the rats to go away, so they hired this guy, the Pied
2 Piper. He played this tune, the rats followed him into the river. The
3 rats drowned, he saved the world. He charged then an exorbitant price
4 to save the grain. They were concerned the price was too high, they
5 didn't pay him. He came back the next day, played his pipe, led all the
6 children out of their village, and towards the river, the concern was
7 he was going to drown the children. But no, he didn't drown the
8 children. He took them up into the mountains there, and never seen
9 again. Is there a correlation between TikTok stealing our children? If
10 the answer is a strict no for you, then you're not considering it well
11 enough. Another story that I read recently to my grandson, the
12 Pinocchio. Everyone knows about Pinocchio and his nose. Often the part
13 of the story that we forget is what I've called Wild Island, but in the
14 story, it's called Pleasure Island. Pleasure Island that's where the
15 person runs about, doing whatever they want, taking whatever, eating
16 whatever, thinking there's no consequence. There is a consequence. In
17 the story, the consequence is they were turned into a mule to drag the
18 merchant's cart. Again, it's comical. But at least consider, perhaps,
19 the war isn't for, historically, we were trying to steal each other's
20 food. At some point, we got so much food that we can't eat it all. And
21 then, in my lifetime, it was money. Someone was always after your
22 money, telemarketers. There's always some trickster way into getting
23 your money. Now everyone's so rich that we don't even want each other's
24 money. The battle is for the hearts and minds of our youth. That's why
25 I'm speaking. That's why I'm talking. That's why I'm here. Is that
 really the battles for the minds and hearts of our youth.

1 TikTok, one of my concerns in the bill is that we pass this bill,
2 they go, oh, guess what? We're smarter than you. We're going to change
3 our name. They're going to spell their name correctly. The TICK TOK the
4 parasite I think it is. But I'm torn on this because I don't like
5 censorship, I'm going to be a yes today and then we'll see what
6 tomorrow brings but my message to the youth is don't waste your youth,
7 again there's some cute stuff on TikTok but you got to monitor what
8 you're putting inside your hearts and mind. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

9 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you representative, further discussion
10 on the bill, Majority Leader Vinton.

11 REP. VINTON: Thank you Mr. Chairman, I'm going to support this
12 bill today for a couple of reasons and I'm going to continue in the
13 vein of my storytelling role mates here. First, I reject the notion
14 that if we support this bill. We don't care about other companies or
15 other adversaries. We do, this bill pertains to one adversary and one
16 company and that leads me to my I don't know if it's a story, it's the
17 same, how do you eat an elephant, one bite at a time, vote green.

18 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you members, as further discussion on
19 the bill three in the queue 12 minutes away from cloture Representative
20 Buckley.

21 REP. BUCKLEY: Thank you Mr. Chair, I want to rise in opposition
22 of this bill for us like just taking a slightly different stance on
23 this. I don't use TikTok. I also have heard about the TikTok
24 challenges. And I've had many of my constituents and friends reach out
25 who use TikTok as a business tool. These are entrepreneurs in Montana
 who are being creative, who are industrious, who are tenacious, who are

1 thinking about how they can reach outside of Montana or across the
2 state. They're oftentimes makers, they're ranchers, they're folks who
3 are reaching out with their Montana made product to other people across
4 the country and are using it as a tool, not only a business tool, but a
5 storytelling tool as well and I've been really moved by those stories,
6 which is why I'm going to be a no today. I'm afraid we're -- I have the
7 same concerns that you all do about privacy, about protecting
8 Montanans. And I'm also afraid we're throwing out the baby with the
9 bathwater and the baby is our entrepreneurs and our folks, who are not
10 -- they're not just kids there, they're Montanans who are making this
11 work, so I'll be a no, and hope we think are really thoughtful about
12 our vote on this, thank you Mr. Chair.

13 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you representative, further discussion
14 Representative Oblander.

15 REP. OBLANDER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I stand in support of this
16 bill as I sat and listened to the comments. Yes, this bill doesn't
17 cover everything and I would venture to say that in this body, we pass
18 many bills that don't cover every circumstance, --

19 [14:05:01]

20 -- everything that possibly could happen. But this is a step in
21 the right direction. And I guarantee you all these other companies that
22 are out there will know that Montana has passed this bill and they will
23 pay attention to that and they will look at their operations and try
24 and decide what they need to do to not have us come back and list them
25 as a company that we shouldn't have in Montana. So, I would encourage

1 you to support this bill. It has a lot of potential to it, and I
2 appreciate everybody's green vote. Thank you.

3 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you, further discussion Representative
4 Carter.

5 REP. CARTER: Thank you, Mr. Chair, I'm against this bill today
6 because as much as I want to protect kids from being kids, and doing
7 the things they want to do. We cannot protect kids from everything and
8 what we can do though is use things like this as a learning tool to
9 say, hey, this is the consequences of doing something like this and all
10 these consequences are not good. Our parents try to protect us from
11 everything. We oftentimes ignore everything until we learn that
12 experience for ourselves. And so, I use this as a learning tool for my
13 kids who are on TikTok and we have that conversation daily about what's
14 appropriate, what's not appropriate, what's being shared, what's not
15 being shared and how you can do this better, and this is a learning
16 tool for the kids that we can protect them right now, but in three to
17 five years or so. We're done protecting them and we have to have had
18 that conversation with them and give them the tools they need, to be
19 able to move forward through a world of technology. Thank you, Mr.
20 Chair.

21 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you representative, there being from no
22 further discussion, does the sponsor wish to close?

23 REP. LER: Thank you Mr. Chair. I sure would, I take great
24 offense to saying that there's a lack of knowledge in this room about
25 issues. We're a hundred-member body from all across the state. I
 believe between all of us here, we can come up with good solutions to

1 just about any problem we face. This bill is not to ban teens from
2 using an app. This bill is to protect our youth. It was also stated
3 that this would be impossible to enforce. I beg to differ. It's
4 probably not impossible, just a little bit inconvenient. We already do
5 this with sports betting apps. They are already geo-fenced in the
6 state. So, with that, Mr. Chair, I entered to due pass.

7 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Thank you. Sponsor has closed. The question
8 now arises on the motion of Representative Ler that when this committee
9 does rise and report after having had under consideration Senate Bill
10 419, it recommends the same be concurred in. Those in favor of the
11 motion will vote aye. Those opposed will vote no. Are there absentee
12 votes?

13 CLERK: None, Mr. Chair.

14 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Has every member voted? Does any member wish
15 to change his or her vote? If not, clerk can record the vote.

16 CLERK: Mr. Chair, 60 representatives have voted aye, 39 have
17 voted no.

18 CHAIRMAN HOPKINS: Senate Bill 419 has been concurred in on
19 second reading.

20 [14:07:57]
21
22
23
24
25



I, Anders Nelson, hereby certify that the foregoing is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, a true and accurate transcription in English.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Anders Nelson', written over a horizontal line.

Anders Nelson
Project Manager
TransPerfect Legal Solutions

June 23, 2023